



October 1, 2013

Federal Housing Finance Agency
Multifamily Housing Policy
400 7th Street, S.W., Room9-261
Washington, DC 20024

RE: August 9, 2013 Notice For Public Input on 2014 multifamily Scorecard

To Whom It May Concern:

On behalf of the investors, employees and most importantly, the residents in our apartment communities, the Waterton Associates LLC welcomes the opportunity to provide Federal Housing Finance Agency (FHFA's) to further Fannie Mae and Freddie Mac's multifamily mortgage activities.

Waterton is a vertically integrated private equity real estate investment firm. Launched in 1995, the Company sponsors multifamily real estate investment funds. Waterton acquires and operates multifamily investments across the U.S. and since inception on behalf of institutional investors. Waterton has invested \$4.8 billion in total capitalization representing \$1.7 billion in equity in the multifamily space. Waterton has invested in 137 real estate transactions consisting of over 48,000 units and 10 debt positions consisting of over 95,000 units with a principal balance of \$6.2 billion

We find it difficult to comment on FHFA's options to implement program changes to shrink Fannie Mae and Freddie Mac's capacity because we view the proposed action as wholly unnecessary. While the perception might be that Fannie Mae and Freddie Mac play an "outsized" role in multifamily mortgage markets, the facts tell a wholly different story.

The enterprises' market share continues to decline and has actually fallen more than the 10 percent FHFA mandated at the start of the year. Indeed, the Mortgage Bankers Association estimates the multifamily origination market in 2012 was approximately \$143 billion, with Fannie Mae and Freddie Mac financing 44 percent of that total. If estimates for a 30 percent or larger increase in multifamily lending in 2013 are accurate, Fannie Mae's and Freddie Mac's market share likely will decline to the 30 percent level or below. This drop reflects the fact that private capital sources have been, and will continue to be, the primary source of mortgage debt for the apartment industry.

On a macro level, our firm's market experience leads us to conclude that artificially limiting the debt provided by the Fannie Mae and Freddie Mac's multifamily programs will harm owners and investors in apartment real estate by limiting options and creating voids in select markets. Private commercial real estate debt can be limited or, in some cases, unavailable in local markets, making critical a national debt source that features a full range of mortgage options.



Furthermore, it is vital to note that Fannie Mae and Freddie Mac support and complement all sources of multifamily debt, and do not exist solely as capital sources in the market. Because they provide the widest range of multifamily mortgage products in today's market, they have broad influence on other debt providers and lead the industry in standard setting. As such, without the Enterprises, the market will lose the competition and innovation that has benefitted borrowers and renters alike.

Additionally of concern, multifamily credit markets do not have a one-for-one replacement dynamic among participants which, in turn, creates meaningful instability in our market if any one participant arbitrarily withdraws. All other sources of multifamily mortgage debt have constraints on their mortgage products, but also have their own beneficial access to capital. Banks have access to depository capital, insured deposits and can borrow from the Federal Reserve at a discount. Insurance companies and pension funds have no requirements or mandates to meet public purpose goals, allowing them to place capital in only the most desirable and beneficial markets, and with the most experienced and credit worthy owners. Accordingly, if implemented, FHFA's proposed actions would negatively impact access to capital and increase borrowing costs market wide to the detriment of borrowers and renters.

As a leader in the multifamily investment business, Waterton utilizes a variety of financing sources including: banks, life insurance companies, and the Enterprises. [Since the beginning of 2011 alone, Waterton and its affiliates have borrowed nearly \$1 billion in debt for the acquisition, development and rehabilitation of multifamily properties across the U.S. with approximately 75% coming from the Enterprises] We believe the Enterprises continue to play an important role in the multifamily market providing Borrowers consistently attractive financing alternatives as other lenders may move in and out of the market as their multifamily lending appetite ebbs and flows.

Any significant pull back by the Enterprises from their role in the financing of the multifamily market, we believe will reduce the liquidity in the market and the attractiveness of multifamily development and refurbishment, which will lead to reduced availability and affordability of the multifamily housing stock in many areas across the country.

Fannie Mae's and Freddie Mac's multifamily lending programs are a model for prudent apartment real estate lending. Their programs have a long history of strong credit performance and have recently adapted to both backstop the markets effectively and shift their programs from balance sheet investment lending to securitized lending. We implore FHFA to avoid implementing further reductions



or placing caps on Fannie Mae and Freddie Mac's origination levels and securitization activities with regard to multifamily finance.

We appreciate the opportunity to share our views and welcome your questions, should you have them.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "David R. Schwartz", with a large, stylized flourish extending to the right.

David R. Schwartz
Chief Executive Officer and Co-Chairman
Waterton Associates

cc: Douglas Bibby, President, National Multi Housing Council
Senator Richard Durbin-IL
Senator Mark Kirk-IL
Representative Mike Quigley-IL